

NEW YORK STATE  
LEGISLATIVE TASK FORCE ON DEMOGRAPHIC RESEARCH AND  
REAPPORTIONMENT

PUBLIC HEARING  
CONGRESSIONAL AND STATE LEGISLATIVE REDISTRICTING

St. Francis College, Founders Hall Auditorium

182 Remsen Street

Brooklyn, New York 11201

Wednesday, February 1, 2012

10:30 a.m.

TASK FORCE MEMBERS PRESENT:

ASSEMBLY MEMBER JOHN J. MCENENY, Co-Chair

SENATOR MICHAEL F. NOZZOLIO, Co-Chair

SENATOR MARTIN M. DILAN

ASSEMBLY MEMBER ROBERT OAKS

DEBRA LEVINE

ROMAN HEDGES

WELQUIS LOPEZ

LEWIS HOPPE

INDEX

	Page
MR. CHAIM ISRAEL PRESIDENT YMHA of Borough Park	7
MR. MEIR WIKLER	10
DR. WAH LEE BOARD MEMBER OCA NEW YORK	17
MR. ARI KAGAN BOARD MEMBER UNITED ASSOCIATION OF EAST EUROPEAN JEWRY	22
MR. GENE A. JOHNSON, JR.	29
MS. ELEANOR MORETTA ADVISORY BOARD MEMBER COMMON CAUSE NY	32
MR. STEVE CHUNG MEMBER ACCORD	38
MR. BEN AKSELROD	43
MS. ROSALIND THOMAS BLACK WOMEN FOR FAIRNESS EQUITY & JUSTICE IN GVT AND PUBLIC SERVICE	47
BISHOP SYLVETTA HAMILTON-GONZALES WOMEN FOR FAIRNESS, EQUITY & JUSTICE IN GVT AND PUBLIC SERVICE	47
DR. UNA CLARKE WOMEN FOR FAIRNESS, EQUITY & JUSTICE IN GVT AND PUBLIC SERVICE	50

Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

MS. DIANE JACKSON	52
COOPER PARK TENANTS ASSOCIATION	
MS. KAREN LEADER	55
COOPER PARK TENANTS ASSOCIATION	
MS. LAURA HOFMANN	57
MR. ALAN ROSNER	61
MS. PAMELA RODERICK	63
MS. CHARLENE PHILLIPS	64
COMMUNITY BOARD 3	
MR. ERICK BRUZAITIS	65
MR. RICHARD BOATTI	67
MR. ED BROWN	
PRESIDENT	
INGERSOLL TENANTS ASSOCIATION	
MS. JOYCE HENRY	80
MS. VALERY JEAN	81
MS. CATHERINE SMITH	86
MR. CORY PROVOST	87
MS. EVELYN CRUZ	89
MS. ESMERALDA SIMMONS, ESQ.	93
EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR	
CENTER FOR LAW AND SOCIAL	
JUSTICE,	
MEDGAR EVARS COLLEGE, CUNY	
MS. JOANNE SIMON	101
DISTRICT LEADER 52 <sup>ND</sup> AD	

DR. VONI JOHYN

104

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 (The public hearing commenced at 10:30  
3 a.m.)

4 ASSEMBLY MEMBER JOHN J. MCENENY, CO-  
5 CHAIR, NYS LEGISLATIVE TASK FORCE ON DEMOGRAPHIC  
6 RESEARCH AND REAPPORTIONMENT: Good morning. See  
7 if we are on here, yes. My name is Jack McEneny.  
8 I'm a member of the New York State Assembly. I  
9 represent parts of Albany County and City up the  
10 Hudson. Here today is the LATFOR task force for  
11 redrawing lines of representation for Senate and  
12 the Assembly are the six members of LATFOR. I  
13 will introduce the assembly side first. I'm the  
14 co-Chair. To my immediate left is a long time  
15 friend who represents an area also in upstate New  
16 York who is Bob Oaks. Next to him is the citizen  
17 representative who is Dr. Roman Hedges and down  
18 at the end is Mr. Hoppe, Lew Hoppe, who has been  
19 involved in this for many years and is the co-  
20 Executive Director. Senator.

21 SENATOR MICHAEL F. NOZZOLIO, CO-CHAIR,  
22 NYS LEGISLATIVE TASK FORCE ON DEMOGRAPHIC  
23 RESEARCH AND REAPPORTIONMENT: Thank you, Jack.  
24 Good morning, ladies and gentlemen. My name is

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 Mike Nizzolio, I am a New York State Senator and  
3 I'm proud to co-chair the New York State  
4 Legislative Task Force on Demographic Research  
5 and Reapportionment along with excellent co-chair  
6 on the Assembly side, Jack McEneny. Jack, this  
7 is our third hearing in the second round. It's  
8 our 17th hearing all together. Some of you have  
9 been at a number of our other hearings. Some of  
10 you are new to this process.

11 Without further ado, though, let me  
12 introduce the members of the task force from the  
13 Senate side. First and foremost, is the Senate  
14 member from this region of the state, the  
15 Honorable Senator, Martin Dilan. To his right is  
16 citizen representative appointed by the Senate to  
17 this task force, it's Welquis Ray Lopez. And to  
18 his right is the executive director of the task  
19 force and the Commission, Debra Levine.

20 We are engaging in these hearings and  
21 you are to be complimented for taking your  
22 responsibilities as citizens very seriously. The  
23 testimony that you give today will be recorded  
24 visually by the camera that's behind me and the

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 camera that is in the middle of the auditorium.  
3 We want to thank St. Francis College for their  
4 hospitality and the Borough of Kings, the  
5 Brooklyn hearing will now commence.

6 We ask you to be concise with your  
7 comments. If you have extensive comments, the  
8 best way to engage is to summarize those  
9 comments, submit the written testimony and we  
10 will ensure that that written testimony is part  
11 of the record. Your oral testimony is part of  
12 the official record, and, again, that is being  
13 videotaped and will be on the LATFOR web site for  
14 all to see. Are there any members of the task  
15 force that wish to speak, and, Senator Dilan,  
16 thank you for your hosting this event and  
17 appreciate your leadership on the Commission.

18 SENATOR MARTIN M. DILAN, NEW YORK STATE  
19 LEGISLATIVE TASK FORCE ON DEMOGRAPHIC RESEARCH  
20 AND REAPPORTIONMENT: I just want to say thank  
21 you and, first and foremost, I just want to let  
22 everyone know from King's County Brooklyn, that  
23 we're eager to hear what you have to say and  
24 hopefully at the end of the day, the panel will



1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 modify the lines to the liking of everyone and I  
3 know that's impossible but I guess they will try  
4 their best. But I also want to, again, welcome  
5 the panel once again to Brooklyn and thank St.  
6 Francis College and Chancellor Macchiarola for  
7 hosting us this morning, thank you.

8 SENATOR NOZZOLIO: Thank you, Senator  
9 Dilan. Any other members of the Task Force wish  
10 to speak at this point? Let me, then, call the  
11 first witness. It's Chaim Israel. Chaim. Those  
12 microphones are probably too far away from you.  
13 Feel free to pull--no, they're not? All right,  
14 well, give it a try.

15 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: And if you  
16 represent a group, please mention that group as  
17 well for the record because this eventually gets  
18 turned into a transcript.

19 MR. CHAIM ISRAEL: All right. Good  
20 morning, Chairman, members of the New York State  
21 Legislative Task Force on Demographic Research  
22 and Reapportionment. My name is Chaim Israel.  
23 I'm a life long resident in Borough Park. I've  
24 been active in the community for the majority of

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 my adult life. I'm the current president of the  
3 YMHA of Borough Park located on 14th Avenue.  
4 Four months ago I had the privilege to testify at  
5 a public hearing in Borough Hall before this  
6 legislative task force.

7 The testimony dealt with the long  
8 standing aspirations of our community to have a  
9 legislative district which will enable our  
10 community to elect a state senator who will  
11 reflect our values, voice our concerns and  
12 represent our needs in the halls of the Senate as  
13 a full partner in the process, not merely as an  
14 accommodation.

15 Currently the current lines have us  
16 represented by five senators and it doesn't make  
17 it any better than two. The results of the task  
18 force were published a few weeks ago in the local  
19 media which was reported with great enthusiasm  
20 throughout the district. As we all recognize  
21 that our community's being treated fairly, with  
22 respect and dignity, no different than any other  
23 of the ethnic neighborhoods in this great and  
24 diverse state of New York State.

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 We have a propose district which puts  
3 the great majority of our voters in a single  
4 district, thus, giving the voters the opportunity  
5 to make a political difference in Albany, rather  
6 than the heretofore situation where our community  
7 was cut into five separate districts, denying us  
8 the rights of effective representation, which is  
9 contrary to what other communities throughout the  
10 state of New York are routinely granted in the  
11 various ethnic minority districts throughout the  
12 state of New York.

13 While our needs in our community are  
14 unique, our community's no different than anyone  
15 else. All the communities, just take a look at  
16 the communities represented right behind me. The  
17 Asian community, the Russian community, many  
18 other communities who have the same desires and  
19 aspirations that we in Borough Park do have to  
20 participate in the political process of this  
21 great nation, America.

22 The voters of our community are elated  
23 with the proposed district lines as are those  
24 elected officials who trust the voters in our

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 district. They believe that our community  
3 deserves to be treated with the same respect and  
4 dignity as all New Yorkers deserve and have come  
5 to expect. For anyone to suggest that the status  
6 quo is good for Borough Park is naive at best,  
7 insincere at worst. Thank you very much for this  
8 opportunity.

9 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: Thank you.

10 Any questions from the panel? We ask you to  
11 linger just a moment in case there are questions.  
12 Very well, thank you very much for your  
13 testimony.

14 MR. ISRAEL: You're welcome.

15 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: Thank you.

16 Meir Wikler.

17 MR. MEIR WIKLER: Morning. My name is  
18 Meir Wikler. I'm a practicing psychotherapist.  
19 I live and work in the Borough Park section of  
20 Brooklyn and it was with great personal sacrifice  
21 that I had to rearrange my schedule this morning  
22 in order to be here to testify this morning but I  
23 am extremely moved and personally upset by the  
24 voices that have been expressed recently opposing

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 the proposed changes to the senatorial district  
3 lines in our neighborhood. I was also at the  
4 hearings four months ago--

5 SENATOR NOZZOLIO: [interposing] Excuse  
6 me, excuse me, could you articulate the  
7 neighborhoods you're referencing.

8 MR. WIKLER: Yes, I live in Borough  
9 Park. I'm also a long standing resident of  
10 Borough Park. I work and live in that  
11 neighborhood and I'm here articulating the  
12 feelings of many of my neighbors in the Borough  
13 Park Flatbush area of Brooklyn. As was  
14 previously stated, our neighborhood was divided  
15 up among five senatorial districts previously.

16 There's a proposed map that has recently  
17 been submitted that would unify a Borough Park  
18 and Flatbush Orthodox Jewish communities into one  
19 senatorial district. When that map was first  
20 publicized in the media, my neighbors and I were  
21 elated that, finally, we were going to have a  
22 unified voice in Albany. And more recently,  
23 there's been some voices expressing a preference  
24 to go back to the old lines that were originally

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 drawn.

3 I believe that there are elected  
4 officials that are using incumbent influence to  
5 protect incumbent interests which I would  
6 certainly share if I was an elected official.  
7 And I'm not, I'm a community resident and I and  
8 my neighbors feel very strongly that the new  
9 lines that were drawn that unify the community  
10 represent our interests.

11 Now four months ago I was also at these  
12 hearings and had to wait a lot longer than I did  
13 this morning until my turn came. And as a result  
14 of that I listened to dozens and dozens of  
15 community people, elected officials, community  
16 representatives, various organizations,  
17 testifying and over 90 percent of the testimony  
18 basically made the same point, keep my  
19 neighborhood together. Let us vote as a unit.  
20 Everyone was saying the same thing. Different  
21 ethnic groups, perhaps, different neighborhoods,  
22 but everyone wanted the same thing. They wanted  
23 the neighborhood kept together.

24 Our neighborhood was not together

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 originally. We were divided, as stated before,  
3 by Rabbi Israel. We were divided among five  
4 senatorial districts. The new lines unite the  
5 Borough Park Flatbush communities into one voting  
6 district which serves our needs. The interest we  
7 have is no different from anybody else. Every  
8 community wants to be kept together.

9 That's what I heard at the hearings  
10 before, that's what was echoed by every one of  
11 the speakers that I listened to and we don't want  
12 anything different than they do. And we have new  
13 lines that have been proposed and some people are  
14 challenging that now, which is making the  
15 neighbors and myself furious.

16 Now I just wanted to point out that  
17 every ten years there's a census taken. And the  
18 purpose of the census is to acknowledge and  
19 assess the demographic shifts that have taken  
20 place in the last ten years. It's not only for  
21 numbers, it's also to represent the changes in  
22 the neighborhood. The new district lines that  
23 have been drawn reflect the facts on the ground  
24 that this is one community that's contiguous of

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 Borough Park and Flatbush that has a  
3 predominately Orthodox Jewish residency and it's  
4 reflected in the new district lines.

5 If we're going to go back to the old  
6 district lines, then I have a question, what do  
7 we have to go to all the expense, the time and  
8 the effort and the money to have a census taken  
9 if we're not going to use that census data. The  
10 census data reflect that Borough Park and  
11 Flatbush are a contiguous ethnic community that  
12 would like to vote together as one district.

13 The new lines represent that and I am  
14 here requesting that those new lines be accepted  
15 and that the voices that are opposing it are  
16 special interests, representing incumbent  
17 interests of certain elected officials and do not  
18 represent the needs and the interests of our  
19 community. I thank you for listening and I thank  
20 you for allowing me to participate in the  
21 Democratic process this morning.

22 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: Thank you.  
23 You did mention it was difficult to rearrange  
24 your schedule. That's why anybody can testify on



1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 anything in the state of New York or on Congress  
3 for that matter as well as Senate and Assembly  
4 and that's why, in our second round, having  
5 listened to people, we have four public hearings  
6 in the city of New York.

7 Two are in the late afternoon, evening,  
8 the one yesterday was in the Bronx and it went  
9 from three o'clock until nearly eight o'clock and  
10 the one on Tuesday, for anybody who's following  
11 this and regretting that it wasn't convenient for  
12 them to come, the one in Queens will be held on  
13 Tuesday and that's another one that will start at  
14 three in the afternoon and go as late as it needs  
15 to go.

16 MR. WIKLER: Thank you again for giving  
17 me the opportunity to participate this morning.

18 SENATOR NOZZOLIO: Appreciate your  
19 input. Thank you very much.

20 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: Thank you.  
21 Jerry Batamalla. Jerry Batamalla. Okay we'll  
22 get to him. What we do is, we go in order and  
23 then we come back and read the names again. And  
24 then we continue to take other people signing on

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 as long as we're here. Doctor Wah Lee.

3 DOCTOR WAH LEE: Hi, Sir. Good morning.  
4 My name is Doctor Wah Lee and I'm a Board Member  
5 of OCA in New York. Founded in 1976, OCA New  
6 York is a nonprofit, nonpartisan organization  
7 dedicated to protecting and advancing the  
8 political, economic and cultural rights of Asian  
9 Americans. OCA New York Chapter represents the  
10 five boroughs of New York City. OCA New York is  
11 a founding member of accord. On behalf of OCA  
12 New York, I testified in the LATFOR hearings in  
13 Brooklyn on September 20th, 2011, to advocate for  
14 district lines that keep large Asian American  
15 communities of interest together.

16 Today I am responding to LATFOR's  
17 proposed mass for Brooklyn. Support for my  
18 statement is based on other OCA New York Brooklyn  
19 members, data from the American Community Survey,  
20 2010 Census and my personal work experience. I  
21 grew up in Bensonhurst where I worked in my  
22 parents' drycleaner and attended PS247. I am now  
23 40 years old and live in Bensonhurst district 23.  
24 I commute from Bensonhurst to Manhattan's

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 Chinatown where my medical office is located.

3 The 2010 Census reviewed Asian Americans  
4 now comprise 13% of the city's population with  
5 over a quarter million in Brooklyn alone. With  
6 respect to state assembly lines, on September  
7 20th, 2011, I testified in support of a state  
8 assembly district that linked parts of Sunset  
9 Park and Bensonhurst. LATFOR's proposed state  
10 assembly district 49 contained Sunset Park and  
11 Bensonhurst. We do appreciate LATFOR's  
12 recognition of the community of interest that  
13 exists between Sunset Park and Bensonhurst.

14 The Asian American population in  
15 Brooklyn grew by 41% since 2000, linking Sunset  
16 Park with Bensonhurst underscores this pattern of  
17 growth of the Asian American community in  
18 Brooklyn. At the first LATFOR hearing, OCA in  
19 New York recognized Bensonhurst was too large to  
20 constitute a state assembly district by itself.  
21 We are pleased to see that LATFOR's proposed  
22 state assembly district 47 keeps in tact the  
23 majority of the Bensonhurst neighborhood.

24 With respect to the state senate lines,

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 consistent with my prior testimony on state  
3 assembly lines, I testified in support of a state  
4 senate district that contains all of Bensonhurst  
5 and Sunset Park, however, LATFOR's proposed  
6 senate districts 22 and 23 divide the  
7 neighborhood of Bensonhurst into two districts,  
8 diluting Asian American voting power. Proposed  
9 district 22 scatters parts of Bensonhurst Asian  
10 American community with neighborhoods as far away  
11 and different as Manhattan Beach and Sheep's Head  
12 Bay.

13 Proposed district 23 scatters parts of  
14 Bensonhurst Asian American community was Stanton  
15 Island and Coney Island. These three geographic  
16 areas are not dependent upon each other.  
17 Proposed senate district 17 and 20 divide Sunset  
18 Park's Asian American community into two  
19 districts at the very core of the community,  
20 dividing 8th Avenue in half.

21 This is the busiest strip spanning over  
22 a mile in Sunset Park's Chinatown where residents  
23 continually cross 8th Avenue to visit stores and  
24 restaurants on either side. The congestion

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 caused by constant foot traffic and deliveries  
3 back and forth across 8th Avenue frequently  
4 interrupts traffic.

5 By contrast, OCA New York endorsed the  
6 unity map that shows one state senate district  
7 that contains all of Bensonhurst and Sunset Park  
8 linked by 65th Street. These neighborhoods have  
9 shared economic ties, resources and social  
10 networks. 2010 Census data shows Sunset Park as  
11 35% Asian and Bensonhurst as 37% Asian. The  
12 American Community Survey shows 80% of Chinese  
13 speakers in Sunset Park speak English less than  
14 very well, similar to 61% in Bensonhurst.

15 Brooklyn Asian Voice organization, based  
16 in Sunset Park, conducts regular clean up efforts  
17 in Bensonhurst. Asian Community United Society  
18 based in Bensonhurst, often does community  
19 outreach in Sunset Park. Libraries in both  
20 neighborhoods have programs that cater to  
21 Brooklyn's Hispanic and Asian residents. Asians  
22 in Sunset Park and Bensonhurst usually go to  
23 Lutheran Medical Center in Sunset Park,  
24 especially after Victor Memorial hospital in Bay

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 Ridge shut down.

3 I have attended weddings of Bensonhurst  
4 friends in Sunset Park because Chinese  
5 restaurants in Sunset Park are larger and more  
6 established. Sixty fifth Street links the two  
7 majority Asian neighborhoods of Sunset Park and  
8 Bensonhurst and caters to both of them. For  
9 instance, since my last testimony, I recently had  
10 to organize funeral services for my father-in-  
11 law. For the benefit of my in-law's family who  
12 are scattered throughout Sunset Park and  
13 Bensonhurst, we chose the funeral home, Ralph  
14 Aievoli and Son, Incorporated, located on 65th  
15 Street, right in between these two neighborhoods.

16 This business recognized the change of  
17 demographics of these inter-kinetic  
18 neighborhoods. They have hard Chinese speaking  
19 staff and offer funeral services in Chinese. My  
20 neighbor, who is Chinese American, and has lived  
21 in Bensonhurst all his life, also used this  
22 funeral home on 65th Street, when his father  
23 passed away. OCA New York sincerely requests  
24 LATFOR to re-examine the maps endorsed by a court

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 and redraw the state senate lines in accordance  
3 with the same principles of redistricting that  
4 keeps state assembly districts with large Asian  
5 Americans communities of interest together.

6 Thank you.

7 SENATOR NOZZOLIO: Any questions,  
8 members of the panel. I have a question, Doctor.  
9 Thank you very much for your testimony. The  
10 Senate is extremely mindful of the need to  
11 enhance the majority of all minority  
12 representation possible and that's why I'm very  
13 pleased that in Queens, that the state senate,  
14 for the first time, has established a majority  
15 Asian American district within the borough of  
16 Queens. And this testimony, if you combine the  
17 Asian American population in both the 23rd  
18 proposed district and the 22nd proposed district,  
19 under the best accounts, that would still be a  
20 minority population.

21 It would not reach to the levels at this  
22 point. Maybe the next census ten years from now  
23 certainly will show that it is the majority but  
24 it is far under a majority now. Even if you

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 combine every Asian under the census in both of  
3 those proposed districts, which are recommended.  
4 I just wanted to state that--

5 DR. LEE: [interposing] I am still  
6 recommending that. I do acknowledge what you're  
7 saying. We have done the research and we  
8 understand that. We are not looking--what we  
9 are, OCA New York is seeking is keeping  
10 communities of interest together. Basically  
11 following the guidelines of what we understand  
12 restricting to be about. It is less important,  
13 our primary goal is not to put all the Asians  
14 together and form a majority district. Our goal  
15 is just to hope that the redistricting lines  
16 conform to the guidelines of keeping communities  
17 of interest together.

18 SENATOR NOZZOLIO: Thank you very much.

19 DR. LEE: Thank you, sir.

20 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: Ari Kagan.

21 MR. ARI KAGAN: Good morning. My name  
22 is Ari Kagan. I live in - - Brighton Beach and I  
23 volunteer as a board member of several Brooklyn  
24 Jewish organizations. Particularly, I'm a board



1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 member of the United Association of East European  
3 Jewry. I would like to thank members of Task  
4 force for the opportunity to express my opinion  
5 regarding districting.

6 SENATOR NOZZOLIO: Excuse me, sorry for  
7 the brief interruption, I appreciate everyone  
8 being able to voice their opinion. I also  
9 appreciate everybody being able to view the  
10 proceedings. So those who are standing and  
11 holding up signs, I think the--certainly, you've  
12 made your sign, a point.

13 If you'd be so kind as to, you can still  
14 keep the sign in your lap but if you'd sit down  
15 so that people behind you, and maybe, put the  
16 sign down so people behind you could see the  
17 testifier in the back row, that would be, I  
18 think, be so kind or maybe if you want to sit in  
19 the front row here. But at least get away from  
20 blocking people behind you. I think this lady,  
21 there, you're blocking the people that are  
22 behind--same is true with this gentleman.

23 You want to sit over here with your  
24 signs? You got to sit right over here. You sit

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 right over here with your signs, that'd be fine.

3 SENATOR DILAN: You can come to the  
4 right and the left and sit up there with the sign  
5 if you want to.

6 SENATOR NOZZOLIO: If you want.

7 SENATOR DILAN: At least the people in  
8 the back can see it. All right.

9 SENATOR NOZZOLIO: Miss, please take  
10 that.

11 SENATOR DILAN: Take it, you can come in  
12 the front.

13 SENATOR NOZZOLIO: Come over here, Miss.  
14 People are behind you.

15 SENATOR DILAN: Right there, see, that's  
16 good.

17 SENATOR NOZZOLIO: You're welcome to  
18 come over here.

19 SENATOR DILAN: Right there, you can  
20 come put them on, that's not a problem. It's not  
21 blocking anybody. Thank you.

22 SENATOR NOZZOLIO: Thank you very much.  
23 Please have a seat. Thank you very much. Please  
24 continue.

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 MR. KAGAN: I will start from, all over  
3 again. Good morning, my name is Ari Kagan, Ari  
4 Kagan. I live in - - Brighton Beach and I  
5 volunteer as a board member of several Brooklyn  
6 Jewish organizations. I am member of the board  
7 of the United Association of East European Jewry.  
8 I would like to thank members of Task force for  
9 the opportunity to express my opinion regarding  
10 redistricting.

11 Currently I live in the 27th senatorial  
12 district which is comprised of neighborhoods of  
13 common interest. I came to New York from the  
14 Former Soviet Union in 1993. Until then, my  
15 family lived in Bensonhurst Boarder Park, Midwood  
16 and Brighton Beach so I will speak my mind from  
17 my own life experience here in Brooklyn.

18 When I saw the proposed boundaries of  
19 the new senatorial districts in south Brooklyn, I  
20 was greatly disappointed and upset. This plan  
21 ignores all traditional and common sense  
22 constitutional principles of fair and objective  
23 redistricting. When I studied in Borough  
24 College, I learned about these principles,

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 compactness and continuity, communities of shared  
3 interest including similar economic patterns and  
4 educational backgrounds, demographics and  
5 cultural characteristics. Unfortunately, the  
6 current LAFTOR proposal splits the 27th  
7 senatorial district into four, four separate  
8 pieces.

9 Instead of uniting similar communities  
10 of south Brooklyn, this plan actually divides  
11 them. Why middle class, Brighton Beach, my own  
12 neighborhood, that has always been an integral  
13 part of south Brooklyn is suddenly united in one  
14 senatorial district with North Shore of Staten  
15 Island, a low income neighborhood of Staten  
16 Island. Where regions of east New York is their  
17 very own different issues should be represented  
18 in Albany by a senator who would be also forced  
19 to address issues of Ships of Bay, east New York  
20 and Ships of Bay.

21 It is of the current - - senatorial  
22 district are well served but by the same  
23 community boards, educational counsels, same  
24 police precincts, that reflect current

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 communities and their issues. I'm talking about  
3 schools, crimes, economic opportunities, housing  
4 - - and income levels. North Shore and east New  
5 York have very different neighborhood  
6 characteristics and demographics. And I'm sure  
7 their residents will not appreciate the new  
8 senatorial district lines as well.

9 I believe there is a way to create  
10 unique district for the Orthodox Jewish community  
11 without splitting existing Russian speaking  
12 community and other immigrant communities in  
13 south Brooklyn.

14 I would respectfully ask members of task  
15 force to include all Ships of Bay and larger  
16 parts of Bensonhurst, as well as neighborhoods  
17 near Brighton Beach, Sea Gate, Coney Island - -  
18 Barcelona Park, into the current 27 district. It  
19 will become larger but much more unified in terms  
20 of culture, ideology, education, income, etc.  
21 And this new district will be real, compact and  
22 contiguous. I urge members of task force to  
23 reconsider proposed lines for south Brooklyn and  
24 not to make parties partisan and gerrymandering .

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 Thank you so much.

3 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: Thank you very  
4 much for your testimony.

5 MR. KAGAN: Thank you very much.

6 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: Gene A.  
7 Johnson, Jr.

8 MR. GENE A. JOHNSON, JR.: Good morning.  
9 My name is Gene A. Johnson, Jr. I reside at 1655  
10 Flatbush Avenue, which is in the Flatlands  
11 [phonetic] neighborhood of King County, which is  
12 currently in the 11th congressional district,  
13 21st state senate district and 41st state  
14 assembly district. I want to make a couple of  
15 comments, I'll keep it brief.

16 As I stated before earlier in one of  
17 your hearings, as I look at the members of  
18 LATFOR, I cannot help but notice the lack of  
19 diversity. In New York State where blacks make  
20 up nearly 16% of the population, totaling over  
21 three million, and where there are several  
22 districts that are influenced by the Voting  
23 Rights Act, there is not a single black person on  
24 LATFOR.

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2           In addition, females are majority that  
3           make up 50% of New York State population, yet  
4           they are not adequately represented on LATFOR as  
5           well. Blacks and females have traditionally been  
6           disenfranchised in regards to voting rights and  
7           should not only have a voice, they should have  
8           representation in this decision making process.

9           In my community, we have representation  
10          from three separate local community boards within  
11          a five block radius. In a practical sense it  
12          means that I can leave my house in the morning on  
13          my way to work, drop off my shirt at a local dry  
14          cleaners, take the subway to work, all within  
15          four blocks. But within that four blocks I have  
16          crossed three different community boards. I was  
17          hoping that my Congressional State Senate and  
18          state assembly districts do not take heed to the  
19          drawing of these imaginary boundaries.

20          There also should be population equity.  
21          I truly, strongly believe in one person, one  
22          vote. In keeping with the theme, all districts  
23          should have as close to zero deviation as  
24          possible. The current system where there are

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 deviations, is not fair and it allows members in  
3 certain districts to have more resources and  
4 access to those resources than in others.

5 Lastly, I strongly urge you to put politics aside  
6 and refrain from the zigzagging, fingering,  
7 gerrymandering maps that are currently proposed.

8 I thank you for your time.

9 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: Thank you.

10 Eleanor Moretta.

11 MS. ELEANOR MORETTA: Good morning. My  
12 name is Eleanor Moretta and I'm a board member of  
13 Common Cause New York. Thank you for allowing me  
14 to testify today. I'm a long time resident of  
15 Brooklyn and have been an activist in my  
16 community for many years. As Common Cause New  
17 York has testified on numerous occasions, we are  
18 strong supporters of independent redistricting.  
19 When it became clear that members of the  
20 legislature were not going to keep their promise  
21 to reform this process, we at Common Cause New  
22 York took matters into our own hands to draw  
23 independent, nonpartisan redistricting plans for  
24 the entire state.



1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2           We're not armchair critics, though. We  
3 know how difficult it is to balance the  
4 requirements of federal law and the state  
5 constitution while maintaining low population  
6 deviations and keeping counties and political  
7 subdivisions as intact as possible. With the  
8 Common Cause reform maps, we have proven that it  
9 can indeed be done. Our experience has  
10 reconfirmed our conviction that the redistricting  
11 provisions of our state constitution must be  
12 rewritten, not only to provide for an independent  
13 redistricting process, but also to provide clear  
14 criteria for drawing fair, nonpartisan maps.

15           However, while we work to properly  
16 rewrite the state constitutional provisions, we  
17 must ensure that the district lines that are  
18 adopted this year are not a continuation of the  
19 gerrymandering that has been the hallmark of  
20 redistricting in this state.

21           So we've taken the opportunity presented  
22 by this Brooklyn hearing to examine the LATFOR  
23 drafts for Brooklyn and to compare them with the  
24 Common Cause Reform Maps. Let's start with the

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 Assembly. First, we'd like to recognize and  
3 thank you for the clear improvement from the  
4 current lines in the Sunset Park area. Instead  
5 of continuing to split a distinct neighborhood in  
6 two, the draft plans significantly redraws  
7 Assembly District 49 to keep most of the growing  
8 Asian community in Sunset Park and Bensonhurst  
9 together in a near majority Asian district.

10 At the north end of Brooklyn, however,  
11 we found that opportunities for minorities  
12 representation can be significantly improved and  
13 neighborhoods better kept together. If the  
14 Brooklyn Queens line is crossed at Ridgewood  
15 Bushwick and at Cypress Hill's Woodhaven, we do  
16 not take this lightly.

17 Counties should only be crossed with  
18 significant justification. But in this case,  
19 crossing Brooklyn Queens at these two locations  
20 would allow a third majority Hispanic seat to be  
21 created and would keep together these community  
22 units that extend uninterrupted across the  
23 borough line.

24 We also believe that numerous other

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 draft assembly districts such as 80, 46 and 58,  
3 can be improved to be more compact and based in  
4 neighborhood geography. Now, to move on to the  
5 Senate, the draft plan, again, divides the  
6 distinct neighborhood of Sunset Park into four  
7 separate senate districts, essentially  
8 disenfranchising this growing immigrant  
9 community. Most objectionable is the mile long,  
10 single block wide corridor extending into Sunset  
11 Park from senate district 20, a district based in  
12 the far away, completely different neighborhood  
13 of Crown Heights.

14 Perhaps even worse, is the continued  
15 damage done to the communities of south Brooklyn  
16 by the overt partisan gerrymander of senate  
17 district 22. In half a dozen neighborhoods in  
18 south Brooklyn, one can be within district 22 and  
19 have a neighbor across the street in another  
20 district for no apparent reason. This district  
21 is not shaped as it is due to any federal or  
22 state law requirement.

23 The reason for this district, little  
24 change from the current lines, becomes obvious

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 when one looks at the voter enrollment data.

3 LATFOR's draft senate district 22 is carefully

4 constructed to include those pockets of south

5 Brooklyn where Republican or Conservative

6 registration is highest. The Common Cause Reform

7 Plan offers a clear alternative of what districts

8 based in neighborhood geography and communities

9 of interest, while following the Voting Rights

10 Act would look like.

11 Our plan draws senate district 22 to

12 keep Sunset Park whole and extend to the

13 southeast along the N subway line to Bensonhurst.

14 Sunset Park is demographically distinct from

15 other neighborhoods in south Brooklyn. It is a

16 denser mixed use neighborhood of immigrants and

17 industry with large and growing Hispanic and

18 Asian immigrant populations. And it could be

19 kept whole with no adverse affects to the other

20 neighborhoods of south Brooklyn as the Common

21 Cause Reform Plan demonstrates.

22 This district would be majority minority

23 at 36.8% Asian voting age population and 25.2%

24 Hispanic voting age population. The LATFOR draft

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 creates no comparable district for minority  
3 representation in south Brooklyn. And, in fact,  
4 as you've heard from the other people who've  
5 testified, this is a problem for a lot of groups  
6 and our plan would resolve that.

7 On the subject of partisan  
8 gerrymandering, I'd also like to point out that  
9 although we don't agree with the premise behind  
10 its addition, if a 63rd senate district is to be  
11 added in accordance with the actual population  
12 distribution in the state, it would land in New  
13 York City. Specifically, it would land in lower  
14 Manhattan. Because each Brooklyn district would  
15 be roughly 5,000 voters smaller, senate district  
16 26 would move out of Manhattan, opening the space  
17 for an entirely new lower Manhattan district to  
18 be drawn.

19 Clearly, these proposed draft lines in  
20 Brooklyn are a prime example of why Governor  
21 Cuomo has promised to veto this overtly partisan  
22 plan. I thank you for allowing me to testify and  
23 hope that you take the opportunity now to revisit  
24 the recommendations of the Common Cause Reform

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 Plan for Brooklyn.

3 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: We thank you  
4 for testifying. Common Cause has been at every  
5 single hearing, both the--nearly every hearing.  
6 I think they missed Plattsburg in the first round  
7 and we do appreciate that you bring out different  
8 issues at each of the hearings and don't just  
9 repeat things. It is helpful.

10 We received, 10:30, the night before  
11 last, the revised Common Cause map that conforms  
12 with the Constitution by performing block on  
13 border obligations. Our next speaker is  
14 Esmeralda Simmons. Esmeralda Simmons.  
15 Councilman David Greenfield. Steve Chung.

16 MR. STEVE CHUNG: Good morning. First  
17 of all I would like to express my comment to all  
18 the civilians come forward to testify today and  
19 sacrifice their personal time. I'm one of them,  
20 in taking off of my regular job to voice for our  
21 opinion. We want to make our democracy system  
22 better and hopefully we can improve our quality  
23 of well being. And my name's Steve Chung and I'm  
24 the President of United Chinese Association of

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 Brooklyn.

3 And we are also one of the 13 member  
4 organizations of the Asian American Community  
5 Coalition on redistricting and democracy.  
6 Abbreviation for that is ACCORD, we call  
7 ourselves ACCORD. And UCA, that's--my  
8 organization was founded in 2002 and our goal is  
9 to serve and improve the well being of the  
10 Chinese immigrant and family in the neighborhood  
11 of Bensonhurst Brooklyn.

12 First of all I would like to applaud  
13 LATFOR for being able to draw an assembly  
14 district 49 as the first ever Asian majority  
15 district in Brooklyn. I thank you for the people  
16 there on my right hand side, which is the  
17 assembly. And it appropriately reflects the  
18 rapidly changing demographic in this neighborhood  
19 as well as preserving the Asian community value  
20 and interest with a compact and contiguous  
21 boundary. Assembly district 49 also adequately,  
22 complies with the Voter Right Act.

23 Under the Voting Right Act, the Asian  
24 American population in this assembly district is

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 protected group and fits into the category of  
3 majority minority district. Asian Americans  
4 should be kept together under the new district to  
5 avoid vote dilution and to keep community of  
6 common interest together.

7 In addition, the new AD49 will encourage  
8 more Asian Americans in this district to engage  
9 in voting. Regarding the LATFOR proposed  
10 district map of state senate in Brooklyn Asian  
11 American neighborhoods, I've heard many of the  
12 Russian community and the Jewish community has  
13 the same complaint as what I'm going to say.

14 They are completely, the new proposal,  
15 the LATFOR proposal senate district, they are  
16 completely opposite for the assembly district 49.  
17 The concept's totally different. It slices the  
18 Asian community, which is the true Chinatown in  
19 Bensonhurst and Sunset Park into four senate  
20 districts, which is 17, 20, 22 and 23.

21 Under this four senate district, the  
22 Asian population percentage is slashed down to  
23 18%, 19%, 18%, 9.4%, 22.5% and 12% respectively.  
24 These four districts severely split up the Asian



1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 community interest as well as diluting their  
3 voting strength to the left, a candidate of their  
4 own choice. Among the proposed four senate  
5 districts, particularly, the senate district 22,  
6 has the highest Asian population of 22.5%.  
7 However, it's district, the SD22, the shape  
8 appears to be distorted to extend the population  
9 center is far off from its geographic center.

10 And it actually creates a perception  
11 that has a--trying to grab some of the area for  
12 their own interest. And in contrast to LATFOR's  
13 proposed senate district 22, there is a unity map  
14 which was collectively drawn by Asian American  
15 Legal Defense and Education Fund and Justice  
16 National Institute for Latino Policy and Center  
17 for Law and Social Justice.

18 And it was also endorsed by our  
19 coalition organization, ACCORD. Under the unity  
20 map, state senate 22 combined the LATFOR proposed  
21 assembly district 47 and 49. These two assembly  
22 districts cover the two Brooklyn Chinatowns which  
23 is in Bensonhurst and Sunset Park and it accounts  
24 for 32% and 51% Asian population. Now the new,

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 the unity map new senate district 22 will result  
3 if we combine them together, will result in 41%  
4 of Asian American population. Which is  
5 significantly more than the 22.5% what you  
6 propose.

7 The unity map states district 22 not  
8 only preserve the Asian Americans community  
9 interest and value but also protect them, also  
10 protect them from vote dilution. In addition,  
11 the unity map state district 22 neighborhood has  
12 the fastest and highest Asian American population  
13 growth rate among the entire city. And based on  
14 the CUNY Center for Urban Research, Asian, we  
15 have 57% growth rate. With this growth trend,  
16 the Asian population will be a majority before  
17 next redistricting.

18 And my conclusion is, in Bensonhurst and  
19 Sunset Park, which are also called the true  
20 Chinatowns, they own one of the most resilient  
21 real estate markets under this economic downturn.  
22 The Asian Americans in these two communities turn  
23 many of the empty warehouses into supermarkets  
24 and restaurants and they bring in new business

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 and - - millions of tax dollars into our city.

3 Although Asian Americans contribute  
4 tremendously in city economy, they are extremely  
5 under represented in politics because no Asian  
6 American has ever been elected to public office  
7 in Brooklyn borough. And there is no Asian  
8 American has ever been elected New York State  
9 Senate also. Although we commend to the first  
10 ever Asian majority assembly district 47 in  
11 Brooklyn, but I hope LATFOR should also adopt the  
12 unity map of state district 22 to create a  
13 potential Asian majority senate district. Thank  
14 you.

15 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: Ben Akselrod

16 MR. BEN AKSELROD: Thank you for  
17 pronouncing my name correctly. Good morning, my  
18 name is Ben Akselrod and I live in Brooklyn. I  
19 thank the members of the Task force for the  
20 opportunity to speak my mind today regarding  
21 redistricting. We all greatly appreciate the  
22 work the task force is doing and are here today  
23 to try to help you fulfill your mission in the  
24 best way possible.

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 I will concentrate my remarks on changes  
3 proposed by the Task force to the state senate  
4 district in the heavily immigrant populated  
5 communities of south Brooklyn.

6 Currently left without representation,  
7 the state senate, therefore, without defense in  
8 the redistricting of the state senate. The  
9 current 27 senatorial district is today,  
10 comprised of neighborhoods of common interest  
11 such as Ships at Bay, Brighton Beach, Manhattan  
12 Beach, Midwood Kensington, Bensonhurst and - - .  
13 It unites immigrants from Eastern Europe, mainly  
14 from the Former Soviet Union and Asia.

15 From China, Thailand, India and  
16 Pakistan, with other ethnic and religious groups,  
17 the proposal currently being reviewed splits the  
18 district into four separate districts putting  
19 Brighton Beach together with the North Shore of  
20 Stanton Island, Manhattan Beach with the Bay  
21 Ridge, part of Ships at Bay with east New York  
22 and the rest with a newly created district in  
23 Borough Park.

24 In my opinion and the opinion of

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 thousands of people behind me and an opinion of  
3 thousands of people that are not attending here  
4 today, the current proposal splits apart  
5 neighborhoods and communities of common interest,  
6 particularly, the Russian speaking community. As  
7 it is so eloquently stated on your web site, the  
8 redistricting will determine how every citizen  
9 and community will be represented at the state  
10 and federal level of government for the next ten  
11 years. It will also determine whether New York's  
12 diverse communities will have sufficient  
13 political strength to elect candidates of their  
14 choice.

15 At a time when so many public policy  
16 decisions affect the quality of our daily lives,  
17 your right to fair and effective representation  
18 is crucial. This is a quote from your web site.  
19 As residents and neighbors, we understand that  
20 many things change in ten years. People move,  
21 new housing is built, communities get smaller or  
22 bigger, that's why redistricting must be done so  
23 frequently.

24 However, the 27th district is unique.

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 People who move to the area rarely leave the  
3 area. This is a tightly woven community and the  
4 residents share many common beliefs of what the  
5 American dream means to them. At the same time,  
6 being a part of the Orthodox community as well, I  
7 understand and agree with the desire and  
8 determination to have for its community to have  
9 its own district unified as one district, not  
10 divided into five different districts as it  
11 currently is.

12 I applaud the Task force for trying to  
13 fulfill this request but I'm also certain that  
14 the Orthodox Jewish community is not looking to  
15 destroy an existing district which unites unique  
16 immigrant communities. I believe there is an  
17 alternative course of action that can meet the  
18 needs of both communities. We would ask that you  
19 at Coney Island at large, parts of Bensonhurst  
20 and Ships at Bay to the current 27th district,  
21 making it larger but maintaining the cultural and  
22 ideological makeup of our district.

23 By redistricting in this fashion, you  
24 will still have an opportunity to create a new

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 district based in Borough Park, meeting the needs  
3 of that community as well. And I thank you for  
4 the opportunity to speak here today.

5 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: Thank you.  
6 Sidney Parker. Sidney Parker. Rosalind Thomas.  
7 Rosalind Thomas. Bishop Sylvetta Hamilton-  
8 Gonzales. Who's this now? Okay, Ms. Rosalind  
9 Thomas is first and Bishop, you're next. We  
10 didn't realize she was here.

11 MS. ROSALIND THOMAS: Good morning. I'm  
12 from Barbados and I've lived in Brooklyn for 30  
13 years and I support Congresswoman Yvette Clarke's  
14 proposal.

15 BISHOP SYLVETTA HAMILTON-GONZALES: Good  
16 morning. Honorable members of the New York State  
17 Legislative Task Force and Demographic Research  
18 and Reapportionment, I extend my gratitude to all  
19 of you for this privilege and opportunity to  
20 address you today. I am Bishop Sylvetta  
21 Hamilton-Gonzales, a lifelong constituent of the  
22 11th congressional district in Brooklyn, New  
23 York. I am representing the organization, Women  
24 for Equity and Fairness and Politics in Public

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 Service.

3 My congregation is a majority of whom  
4 are residents of the 11th congressional district  
5 and I understand that our state will lose two  
6 members of congress, therefore, this is my second  
7 time bringing this to your attention that I  
8 endorse the proposed district as presented by  
9 Congress member Yvette D. Clarke, to the LATFOR  
10 on August 4th, 2011 in Albany, New York.

11 The 11th congressional district has  
12 traditionally been a voting rights district and  
13 the proposed changes satisfied the requirements  
14 of the Voting Rights Act while accommodating the  
15 growing population. The community of interest  
16 are preserved and the vitality of the community  
17 in areas such as socioeconomic, cultural,  
18 linguistic and other factors is maintained.  
19 Historically, the concentration of minorities  
20 within central Brooklyn has allowed for the ease  
21 of maintaining compact and contiguous district.

22 However, recent population shifts in the  
23 demographics of central Brooklyn have caused the  
24 borders of the proposed district to be delineated



1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 to ensure the maintenance of a majority minority  
3 district and to avoid vote dilution. The  
4 proposed district further unites the common  
5 interest of the largely Caribbean, African,  
6 Asian, Pakistani, Bangladeshi, Latino and African  
7 American ethnic communities. The current  
8 district is defined by shared interest such as a  
9 social economic, cultural, linguistic and other  
10 factors that indicates commonality of interest.

11 The proposed district respects the  
12 unification of groups such as the aforementioned  
13 with a common interest. Some common links  
14 between groups within the proposed district  
15 include the following, shared educational system  
16 and school attendance. Shared shopping, business  
17 corridors, shared community parks and recreation  
18 centers, common utilization of modes of public  
19 transportation.

20 As such, the proposed district by  
21 Congresswoman Yvette D. Clarke, does not have the  
22 purpose nor will it to have the effect of  
23 defining or abridging the voter's right—the right  
24 to vote on the account of race or color. The

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 present map which is included in your package,  
3 the current map was not adopted with a  
4 discriminatory intent nor does it have a  
5 discriminatory effect.

6 The proposed district is not nor does it  
7 intend to dilute racial and language minority  
8 votes. In fact, its expressed purpose is for  
9 inclusion. In conclusion, I will reiterate my  
10 endorsement for the proposed 11th congressional  
11 district which complies with the Voting Right Act  
12 of 1965. I humbly request that LATFOR, known for  
13 your punctuality in meeting deadlines, execute  
14 the proposed district presented by Congress  
15 member Yvette Clarke, in a timely manner that  
16 will satisfy the New York State primary election  
17 in June 2012. A proposed map for your  
18 consideration is attached. I want to thank all  
19 of you for this opportunity to address your body  
20 today. Thank you.

21 SENATOR DILAN: Thank you, Bishop and  
22 thank you for reminding in case anyone here is  
23 not aware of it that we now do have a primary day  
24 established by the federal court that came down

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 on Friday and the date is June 26th, which  
3 heightens our interest in wrapping this up in an  
4 orderly and prompt manner. Thank you very much,  
5 Bishop.

6 BISHOP HAMILTON-GONZALES: Thank you.

7 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: Thelma Moore.

8 Thelma Moore. Dr. Una Clarke.

9 DR. UNA CLARKE: Good morning  
10 distinguished members. My name is Una Clarke.  
11 This is my third appearance before you and I'm  
12 appearing each time and not only because I'm a  
13 past member of the New York City Council but I  
14 understand the urgency and the importance of  
15 fully participating in the political life of our  
16 community and being advocates on behalf of those  
17 who are disenfranchised. So this morning, I come  
18 on behalf of the 11th congressional district and  
19 I have a lot interest in making sure that the  
20 district remains contiguous and ever growing as a  
21 community.

22 It was first represented by  
23 Congresswoman Shirley Chisholm and as it is, this  
24 is the 40th year of her historic run for

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2           Presidency of the United States of America. So  
3           if you do it for no other reason but to preserve  
4           Shirley's legacy, we ask that you keep the  
5           district as it is and we ask that you add the  
6           numbers of the 87,000 that we have presented to  
7           you that does not disturb the cultural, the  
8           ethnic, the social or the common interest of the  
9           people who live there in central Brooklyn. My  
10          testimony is before you fully in writing.  
11          Congresswoman Yvette D. Clarke has testified  
12          twice before you. This is my third time.

13                   We are advocates for the community. We  
14          want to strengthen the community and make sure  
15          that the community is ever growing and, again, as  
16          the first ever Caribbean American woman to be  
17          elected to the New York City Council, I  
18          understand the power of unity and the power of a  
19          community working together to strengthen itself  
20          and to make its contribution to the United States  
21          of America.

22                   I thank you for listening to me and the  
23          map is again presented by all of us and we hope  
24          that you'll consider it and we're getting ready

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 for the June 26th primary and we hope that you  
3 keep us together so that we work together. Thank  
4 you very much.

5 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: Thank you,  
6 Councilwoman. Joann Simon. Joann Simon. Do we  
7 have any additional sign ups before I go back  
8 through the list? Yes, we do. Diane Jackson.

9 MS. DIANE JACKSON: Good morning.

10 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: Good morning.

11 MS. JACKSON: My name is Diane Jackson  
12 and I am a resident of Cooper Park Houses. A  
13 development owned by the New York City Housing  
14 Authority and located between Frost Street and  
15 Skillman Avenue to the north and south and Morgan  
16 Avenue and Kingsland Avenue to the east and west.  
17 After 27 years, I have recently retired as  
18 President of the Cooper Park Resident Council. I  
19 have worked diligently advocating and  
20 representing the 6099 families in Cooper Park  
21 House.

22 I am here today to request that the  
23 proposed legislative boundaries for assembly  
24 district's 50 and 53 be rejected. These proposed

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 changes negatively impacts our complex consisting  
3 of 13 buildings which separates us from our  
4 surrounding neighbors and a network of community  
5 organizations that we continuously work with for  
6 the betterment of our community. The proposed  
7 district lines for the 50th and the 53rd have one  
8 boundary in the southeast corner running along  
9 Skillman Avenue.

10 This proposed boundary will adversely  
11 impact the community because it will split a  
12 large resident parking lot that offers off street  
13 parking for the residents of Cooper Park Houses  
14 which has been in a dispute in terms of  
15 redevelopment.

16 The parking lot would actually be taken  
17 away from the development. It will split in half  
18 the former Green Point Hospital campus which is a  
19 super block that has been at the center of a  
20 community plan to provide affordable housing and  
21 community facilities to local residents. The  
22 dividing of the Green Point Hospital site will  
23 place a homeless shelter and affordable housing  
24 in one district while an important community

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 facility and housing development site in another  
3 district, not allowing a comprehensive approach  
4 to an integrated campus.

5 The district line separates the NYCHA  
6 residents on the north side of a New York City  
7 park, Cooper Park, not the development, this is a  
8 city park, from the homes and apartments on the  
9 south side.

10 These families work together with us in  
11 planning physical changes and operations in  
12 Cooper Park and on the future use of the Green  
13 Point Hospital. I and a host of my neighbors in  
14 Cooper Park Houses and the surrounding area,  
15 demand that the New York State Legislative Task  
16 Force on Demographic Research and Reapportionment  
17 adopt different district boundaries. We support  
18 a map proposed by Common Cause which has  
19 southeast boundary running along Metropolitan  
20 Avenue.

21 The Greenpoint Hospital campus and the  
22 Cooper Park NYCHA Houses must be kept whole.  
23 This would allow proper representation for both  
24 areas and maintains communities of interest.

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 I have brought with me today, over 200  
3 letters from residents at Cooper Park Houses  
4 opposing this change. Thank you for allowing me  
5 to speak here today. That's all I have to say.

6 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: Thank you.

7 MS. JACKSON: May I submit these to  
8 someone?

9 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: Yes, please.

10 Also from Cooper Park, Karen Leader. David  
11 Debose. Oh, Karen, are you here? Thank you,  
12 come forward, please. David is on deck.

13 MS. KAREN LEADER: Good morning. My  
14 name is Karen Leader and I'm not only a long time  
15 resident of Cooper Park Houses, additionally, I  
16 am a former Cooper Park Houses building captain.  
17 I serve on Cooper Park's resident council, Cooper  
18 Park Community Center Advisory Committee and last  
19 but certainly not least, I serve on Community  
20 Board number one's executive board. I along with  
21 the residents of Cooper Park Houses do not  
22 support the changes in the district boundaries of  
23 the 50th and 53rd assembly district.

24 You can not start positive planning



1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 which impacts an entire community in a negative  
3 manner until you rid yourself of the cunning,  
4 negative plans. For example, these proposed  
5 assembly district lines split the Greenpoint  
6 Hospital campus in half, taking with it our  
7 neighborhoods on Maspeth Avenue, who we have  
8 formed an alliance with in building an improved  
9 community for us all. Additionally, and as  
10 equally important, is that the 53rd district  
11 boundary will also be splitting Cooper Park  
12 Houses parking lot. Our community, through a  
13 coalition known as GREC, Greenpoint Renaissance  
14 Enterprise Cooperation, has been implementing a  
15 multiphase plan to redevelop the Greenpoint  
16 Hospital site for the past 30 years.

17 GREC has brought together small  
18 homeowners, public housing residents, coop and  
19 condo owners and a moderate income renters to  
20 implement improvements, not just for the hospital  
21 site but it's also working on improving the open  
22 space at Cooper Park.

23 Together with GREC, we also continue to  
24 work on other issues such as community safety and

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 truck traffic mitigations. There is no benefit  
3 to having the district lines along Skillman  
4 Avenue unless it's an attempt to divide our  
5 community. This is political posturing. I'm  
6 asking that you take the politics out of this  
7 redistricting. Let's begin positive planning  
8 today by rejecting the current proposal in the  
9 redistricting maps of the 50th and 53rd district.  
10 Let's use the more productive plan which is to  
11 move the district line to Metropolitan Avenue and  
12 not Skillman Avenue.

13 Let's keep the Greenpoint Hospital  
14 campus as a whole unit in the 50th assembly as  
15 well as the homeowners and neighbors along  
16 Maspeth Avenue and Cooper Park Houses parking  
17 lot. You can't adopt a good plan if you continue  
18 to consider the current proposal. Thank you very  
19 much.

20 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: Thank you.  
21 David Debose. David Debose [phonetic]. Is that  
22 David coming down here? Laura Hofmann.

23 MS. LAURA HOFMANN: Hello. Hi, my name  
24 is Laura Hofmann. I'm a resident of Greenpoint

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 in Brooklyn, New York and I'm a member of  
3 OUTRAGE. That's Organizations United for Trash  
4 Reduction and Garbage Equity. Our organization  
5 has been fighting for reduction of truck traffic  
6 and garbage transfer stations in our community.  
7 I'm here today to request that the proposed  
8 legislative boundaries for assembly district's 50  
9 and 53 be rejected because it negatively impacts  
10 a community of interest by splitting up an  
11 important public development and impinges on the  
12 NYCHA complex of buildings. The proposed  
13 district lines for the 50th and 53rd have one  
14 boundary in the southeast corner running along  
15 Skillman Avenue.

16 The boundary will negatively impact the  
17 community. It will split a large parking lot  
18 belonging to the Cooper Park Houses NYCHA  
19 development which has been in dispute in terms of  
20 its development.

21 It will split in half the form of  
22 Greenpoint Hospital campus, which is a super  
23 block that has been at the center of the  
24 community plan to provide affordable housing and

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 community facilities for local residence. The  
3 dividing of the Greenpoint Hospital site will  
4 place a homeless shelter and affordable housing  
5 in one district while an important community  
6 facility and housing development sit in another  
7 district, not allowing a comprehensive approach  
8 to an integrated campus.

9 The district lines divide residents on  
10 the north side of a New York City park, Cooper  
11 Park, from the park and homes on the south side.  
12 All of whom are part of the local civic group,  
13 the Cooper Park Neighbors Association. I and a  
14 host of neighbors in the surrounding area demand  
15 that the New York State Legislative Task Force on  
16 Demographic Research and Reapportionment adopt  
17 different district boundaries.

18 We support a map proposed by Common  
19 Cause which has the southeast boundary running  
20 along Metropolitan Avenue. The Greenpoint  
21 Hospital campus and Cooper Park NYCHA Houses must  
22 be kept whole areas. This would allow proper  
23 representation for both areas and maintain  
24 communities of like interest. On a personal

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 note, during the Greenpoint Williamsburg  
3 rezoning, I chaired one of the Brooklyn Community  
4 Board One's groups, the Parks and Open Space  
5 Subcommittee.

6 And we listened to all the elected  
7 officials and city officials promised that  
8 affordable housing at the Greenpoint Hospital  
9 would go through and if this goes through as is,  
10 you're going to be puncturing a hole through  
11 those promises and basically creating a situation  
12 where there Department of City Planning  
13 Commissioner lied. So I don't see how you can  
14 possibly go forward with this plan as is. Thank  
15 you.

16 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: I have to show  
17 some confusion here in that this seems more like  
18 this would have more of a city implication than a  
19 state lawmaker in Albany. You're concerned about  
20 zoning, development, affordable housing.

21 MS. HOFMANN: For our community it's all  
22 part of one package.

23 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: This is  
24 concerning state representation, not the city

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 council person. Not the community board. I'm  
3 not sure where-

4 MS. HOFMANN: As a community resident I  
5 feel that it's--

6 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: [interposing]  
7 Extreme damage would be done.

8 MS. HOFMANN: By splitting up the  
9 neighborhood?

10 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: For a city,  
11 council - - district maybe.

12 MS. HOFMANN: But the Greenpoint  
13 Hospital, like I said, we were promised all along  
14 that this was going to be developed into  
15 affordable housing. And by dividing the  
16 hospital, this is the site where the affordable  
17 housing would have been. By dividing that  
18 property, it would make it a whole lot harder to  
19 do. And personally, I feel that's the intention  
20 of the plan as is.

21 SENATOR DILAN: And a lawmaker in Albany  
22 having two assembly members instead of one, this  
23 would be a problem.

24 MS. HOFMANN: I believe it would be.

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: Okay, thank  
3 you very much.

4 MS. HOFMANN: You're welcome.

5 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: Alan Rosner.

6 MR. ALAN ROSNER: My name is Alan  
7 Rosner. I'm a native born New Yorker now living  
8 in Prospect Heights. I'm here today to ask that  
9 Governor Cuomo veto this proposed redistricting  
10 plan. My concerns are general and not particular  
11 addressing the process and as I said, I'm here  
12 today to ask that this be vetoed. Like  
13 perspective governors before him, Governor Cuomo  
14 campaigned against corruption.

15 This plan is born out of a corrupt  
16 process for corrupt purposes that simply  
17 perpetuates legislative dysfunction that led to  
18 its creation. The state senate plan  
19 institutionalizes a kind of weighted voting  
20 favoring upstate representation and subverts  
21 representation government as understood as one  
22 person, one vote. This kind of party driven  
23 redistricting will unleash inevitable lawsuits  
24 that will waste legal resources and funds needed

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 for better purposes.

3 It can only be seen as another reason  
4 for citizens discuss with governments that don't  
5 govern in people's interest. There's a part of  
6 that general frustration with how politicians  
7 govern that feeds the anger we see in both the  
8 tea party and the occupy movement. Governor,  
9 please veto this plan, it is toxic, there's  
10 little upside. Keep the spirit of your campaign,  
11 veto this plan, show citizens that governing  
12 doesn't have to be this blatantly dishonest.

13 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: Dena Roytman.

14 Dena Roytman [phonetic]. Pamela Roderick.

15 MS. PAMELA RODERICK: Here. My name is  
16 Pamela Roderick. I live here in this  
17 neighborhood on Hicks Street in Brooklyn Heights.  
18 I speak as an unaffiliated citizen. I am merely  
19 here to express and join the chorus of outrage  
20 that met the release of these lines. You must be  
21 kidding.

22 You seem to have gone out of your way to  
23 destroy communities, to divide neighborhoods.  
24 Some of your lines from the Atlantic Ocean up to



1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 the Great Lakes, they look like they were the  
3 doodles of lunatics. What ails you? You do  
4 nothing, really. I'm glad to see you smile. But  
5 I am absolutely deadly serious.

6 You insult the people of this state, you  
7 insult the state government. You show contempt  
8 for democracy as it is meant to be. And the idea  
9 of squeezing another state senate district into  
10 the least populated part of the state. I mean,  
11 what are you, crazy? How do you expect us to  
12 accept this? You must think we are idiots. We  
13 are outraged. You have insulted me. You have  
14 insulted all of us. You have shown contempt.  
15 And really, you should be ashamed. And that is  
16 all I can say.

17 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: Charlene  
18 Phillips. Charlene Phillips.

19 MS. CHARLENE PHILLIPS: Good morning. I  
20 have testimony but it really seems like we're all  
21 talking about the same thing here. And so I want  
22 to synopsise by saying that what we're looking  
23 for as citizens of this great state is not for  
24 plans that are made for partisan purposes. We're

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 looking for, not politicians that are just  
3 looking for a specific focus but we're looking  
4 for wonderful people serving elected officials  
5 that are willing to do what this nation has been  
6 called to do as a democracy.

7 That's all we're asking as a people.  
8 It's pretty reasonable and I don't think we  
9 deserve any less. Thank you.

10 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: Thank you very  
11 much. Eric—Pronounce it for me, Bruzaitis? Eric  
12 Bruzaitis.

13 MR. ERIC BRUZAITIS: Good morning and  
14 thank you for allowing me to testify. My name is  
15 Eric Bruzaitis. I'm a resident of 37 Kingsland  
16 HDFC and I am President of our Coop Board. I'm  
17 also a member of the GREC Coalition. Thirty  
18 seven Kingsland Avenue is located between Brother  
19 - - to the north and Jackson Street to the south  
20 and between Morgan Avenue and to the east and  
21 Woodpoint Road to the west.

22 I'm here to day to request that the  
23 proposed legislative boundaries for assembly  
24 districts 50 and 53 be rejected because it

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 negatively impacts a community of interest by  
3 splitting up an important public development and  
4 impinges on the NYCHA complex buildings. The  
5 proposed district lines for 50 and 53 have on  
6 particular boundary on the southeast corner of  
7 Woodpoint Road and Skillman Avenue. And running  
8 east along Skillman Avenue to Vandervoort Avenue.

9 This boundary would negatively impact  
10 the community and I will stress the phrase, the  
11 map is not the territory. Greenpoint Hospital  
12 Renaissance Corporation, GREC, the organization  
13 that I'm a member, is a board coalition of groups  
14 that will be split by this proposed  
15 redistricting. GREC has worked for years to  
16 build its coalition. While the 53rd district  
17 would have jurisdiction over the hospital campus,  
18 the old Greenpoint Hospital campus, which was the  
19 genesis of the GREC coalition, the majority of  
20 the stake holders who benefit live within the  
21 50th district.

22 We support the map opposed by common  
23 cause which has its southeast boundary running  
24 along Metropolitan Avenue. Greenpoint Hospital

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 campus in Cooper Park Houses must be kept whole  
3 areas. This would allow proper representation  
4 for both areas and maintain its communities of  
5 like interest.

6 I and a host of my neighbors in the  
7 surrounding area demand that New York State  
8 Legislative Task Force on Demographic Research  
9 and Reapportionment adopt different district  
10 boundaries. Thank you for the opportunity.

11 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: Thank you very  
12 much. Richard Boatti.

13 MR. RICHARD BOATTI: Good morning. My  
14 name is Richard Boatti. Thanks for giving me a  
15 chance to speak today. I'm a member of Act Now,  
16 progressive good government advocacy group and a  
17 concerned citizen. When I testified at the last  
18 Brooklyn hearing on September 20th, I called this  
19 whole process a farce and an exercise in  
20 futility.

21 The legislators on that panel, many of,  
22 I see you here today, told me to reserve judgment  
23 until they released their proposed maps. Well  
24 you released those maps last week and after

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 looking at them, I am not here to plead with you  
3 to change them because you won't. I'm here to  
4 tell each one of the Republican senators here  
5 that you should be ashamed of yourselves. How do  
6 you sleep at night after trying to disenfranchise  
7 a majority of the state's voters. For example,  
8 look at your proposed 20th senate district.

9 Why was it drawn that way? Someone on  
10 this panel, please tell me why it was drawn that  
11 way except to draw the Democratic incumbent, my  
12 senator, Eric Adams out of the district. Now I'm  
13 not a fan of Senator Adams and I vote against him  
14 anytime he is primaried and I don't vote on that  
15 line in the general election. But whether to  
16 keep in Albany or not is up to me and the other  
17 voters of the district and shouldn't be subject  
18 to the partisan hackery of senate Republicans.

19 And while we're at it, can someone on  
20 this panel please explain to me why the proposed  
21 47th senate district is drawn the way it is.  
22 Please enlighten us. Furthermore, in your  
23 proposed maps, the upstate districts average  
24 292,000 residents while the down state senate

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 districts have 315,000 or more. Well isn't that  
3 a lovely coincidence.

4 Thank you so much for making mine and  
5 everybody in this room and every down state  
6 resident have only 93% of the voting power of our  
7 upstate brothers and sisters. You should be very  
8 proud of yourselves. So in sum, shame on each  
9 and every one of you but especially the  
10 Republican senators. It's called public service  
11 for a reason. You're supposed to serve the  
12 people of this state but instead all you do is  
13 serve yourselves and your narrow partisan  
14 political interest.

15 Your proposed map is a farce just like  
16 the very legislature itself. And it has been for  
17 decades because of the lack of accountability  
18 done by this type of gerrymandering. So in sum,  
19 all I have to say is thank god that Governor  
20 Cuomo has rightly stated his intention to veto  
21 this farce.

22 So I will now open the mic to you to try  
23 to defend these proposed districts and I promise  
24 to hold in my laughter while you are lying.

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 Anyone want to defend these districts? I guess  
3 not. All right, thank you.

4 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: We're here to  
5 listen to you.

6 MR. BOATTI: Okay but you can also give  
7 feedback. I mean back and forth happens at these  
8 hearings all the time. It happened last time.  
9 Last time you guys--I testified, you guys  
10 defended it.

11 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: You heard  
12 other people testify who like the districts, they  
13 liked new Asian districts, they're intrigued with  
14 the idea of a new Jewish Orthodox district, you  
15 heard that.

16 MR. BOATTI: Yes, you guys threw a  
17 couple of bones out and that's good. I agree  
18 with certain things that that--

19 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: [interposing]  
20 Well they might consider their issue more than a  
21 couple of bones.

22 MR. BOATTI: Well you know they can have  
23 their--bone is a compliment, I meant that as a  
24 compliment. You give someone a bone, you throw

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 someone a bone, you should do something nice for  
3 them. And there are few small parts of this map  
4 which are good, like the Asian district, for  
5 example.

6 But on the totality, the maps have  
7 birched Democracy and does anyone here want to go  
8 on the record and say that these maps are not a  
9 product of gerrymandering, anybody? Please go on  
10 the record.

11 SENATOR DILAN: Hello. Yes, I just want  
12 to say that I believe I have used, perhaps, maybe  
13 one more that you mentioned here today in  
14 characterizing these lines and I think I've made  
15 it very public that I'm not in support of the  
16 product that we currently have.

17 MR. BOATTI: Thank you, I appreciate  
18 that.

19 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: We remind you  
20 this is a draft. Those who give specific  
21 information are being very helpful. There are  
22 213 districts being proposed. It was interesting  
23 that you mentioned the apparent gerrymander of a  
24 senator. There are, as I understand it, six



1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 senators who would be running one against the  
3 other. So that's obviously partisan but Common  
4 Cause has how many incumbents running against  
5 each other?

6 MR. BOATTI: I'm not familiar with the  
7 Common Cause--

8 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: [interposing]  
9 Well according to Common Cause, 25% of all  
10 representatives are running against another  
11 representative.

12 MR. BOATTI: But in general or the  
13 primary?

14 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: But that's  
15 reform.

16 MR. BOATTI: In a general or a primary?  
17 That's the difference. Because when the  
18 Republicans draw the maps to have Democrats  
19 compete against each other in primaries, put the  
20 Democrats in the same district, whereas if you  
21 actually had Democrats and Republicans competing  
22 in relatively even matched partisan districts,  
23 then that is reform, that's right.

24 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: I have no

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 intention of going into how the senate is drawn,  
3 I did the assembly.

4 MR. BOATTI: Well my comments weren't  
5 directed at you, it's more directed at the  
6 Republican senators.

7 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: But let's just  
8 take Common Cause. If 25%, including some very  
9 important leadership positions that take years of  
10 seniority to acquire, some of whom are from the  
11 minority community that needs every bit of  
12 political clout they can get, are willy-nilly  
13 thrown against one another because somebody says  
14 we didn't look at the map to see where they were.  
15 Is that good government too, to destroy the  
16 seniority of groups or individuals that represent  
17 their community? Is that the ideal either?

18 MR. BOATTI: No the ideal is to have  
19 districts that are drawn relatively compact and  
20 don't favor one party over another and, you know,  
21 like I said, reform is having Democrats and  
22 Republicans compete under relatively, to the  
23 extent possible, fair general elections.

24 But it's not reform to have Republicans

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 force a whole bunch of incumbent Democrats to  
3 primary each other and draw the lines just for  
4 that sole purpose alone and also does anyone want  
5 to address why my downstate residents have only  
6 93% of the voting power in the senate as upstate  
7 ones, other than to protect the Republican  
8 majority? I'm addressing this to the  
9 Republicans, really. I'm not really--

10 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: I'm going to  
11 make one observation, we have districts here,  
12 that if we wanted to make them competitive with  
13 Democrats and Republicans, you'd have to have a  
14 program to import Republicans to parts of New  
15 York City.

16 MR. BOATTI: Yes, obviously, I mean, I'm  
17 not saying every single district. Obviously  
18 there's going to be, especially in downstate, and  
19 upstate, there's going to respectively be several  
20 Democrat and Republican districts that aren't  
21 contested very hardly, very strongly in the  
22 general election but to the extent it can be done  
23 it should. And these lines shouldn't be drawn  
24 just to keep the Republican majority in power.

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 I don't see any other guiding principles  
3 of these lines except in the senate side, except  
4 to keep the Republican majority in power. Now if  
5 any Republicans on this panel want to, Republican  
6 senators on this panel want to contradict me,  
7 please do, but I still have yet to hear a  
8 satisfactory explanation why these lines are  
9 drawn this way. Like, why is 47 drawn the way it  
10 is? Why is 20 and 16 drawn the way it is.

11 What is the contiguous--what's the  
12 community of interest in district 16? Someone  
13 please tell me. I mean, the only reason I think  
14 this district was drawn that way because it  
15 spells out FU, which is basically what the  
16 legislature has said to the voters of the state  
17 with these maps.

18 SENATOR NOZZOLIO: It may be humorous  
19 but there is never a place for profanity.

20 MR. BOATTI: I didn't say profanity.

21 SENATOR NOZZOLIO: Or alleging  
22 profanity. You asked a question, I'll give you  
23 an answer. The question is, why is this district  
24 the way it's configured? Well that is the very

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 first Asian American seat in the history of New  
3 York State. The very first Asian American senate  
4 seat in the history of New York State. It was  
5 through a design to maximize the Asian American  
6 strength. It was a result of seven hours of  
7 hearings in Queens, a number of meetings that  
8 were conducted. A number of citizens who  
9 provided input, it was designed to maximize a  
10 majority, establish a majority of Asian  
11 population within a senatorial district.

12 MR. BOATTI: Well actually I think that  
13 was just a nice plus that you guys are using to  
14 gloss over it when really it just captures a  
15 whole bunch of Democratic votes, it makes the  
16 district incredibly Democrat. Prevents those  
17 votes from being in other districts where they  
18 might be more competitive, like, Martin Goldman's  
19 district.

20 Now, yes, it's great, I definitely  
21 appreciate that there's a majority Asian American  
22 senate district. But that can also be achieved  
23 without this type of gerrymandering and what  
24 about district 20? What's the reason for that?

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: If you have  
3 suggestions that you would like to place on the  
4 record, that is very welcome. And you don't have  
5 to do it here, orally, you can do it in writing.  
6 We have initial hearings that are taking place  
7 tomorrow and next week in the New York City  
8 downstate region. And the purpose of these  
9 hearings is for citizens to analyze the proposals  
10 and to make their views known. You've made your  
11 views known, we would welcome your suggestions  
12 and that that's what the purpose of LATFOR is  
13 about. If there is any comments you'd like to  
14 make, those can be made directly to the web site  
15 and any suggestions that you make, like to make,  
16 about any of the districts that you analyzed,  
17 you're certainly—you input as the input of all  
18 the citizens of this state, are welcome.

19 MR. BOATTI: Well thank you and my  
20 suggestion is just to have a fair process because  
21 you have a corrupt and self influence process, it  
22 produces things like this. You have an  
23 independent entity writing these lines, like,  
24 hopefully will happen when a special master comes

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 along because Governor Cuomo will veto this  
3 ridiculousness, then that is my suggestion. So  
4 thank you for hearing me out.

5 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: Thank you  
6 again. We would remind people that the Queens  
7 public hearing, there's one in Manhattan tomorrow  
8 down at 250 Broadway. The Queens public hearing  
9 will start at 3:00 in the afternoon and go as  
10 late as necessary. Daniel Teets. Daniel Teets.  
11 Ed Brown. This is Mr. Brown?

12 MR. ED BROWN: Good morning. My name is  
13 Ed Brown and I'm the President of the Ingersoll  
14 Tenants Association. I am here today testifying  
15 on behalf of the residents in Walt Whitman and  
16 Farragut Houses also. I am totally in favor of  
17 the current map proposed for the 57th assembly  
18 district just as I am critical of proposals that  
19 I feel will negatively affect the community I  
20 represent.

21 I am also equally supportive of  
22 proposals that affect our community in a positive  
23 way. It only makes sense that Ingersoll, Walt  
24 Whitman and Farragut Public Houses are

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 represented by the same representative in the New  
3 York State Assembly. The residents in these  
4 three communities suffer from the same issues and  
5 should have one elected official representing  
6 them.

7 It also only makes sense that Fort  
8 Greene and Clinton Hill remain in the same  
9 congressional district for similar reasons.  
10 Residents in these two communities experience the  
11 adverse, negative affects when downtown Brooklyn  
12 experienced one of the worst economic downturns  
13 and crime waves during the eighties and nineties.

14 Although many residents fled the  
15 community, others dug in their heels and stayed  
16 the course, working diligently together to turn  
17 these communities around for the better of all of  
18 its residents. Now that downtown Brooklyn is the  
19 place to be because of economic prosperity, it's  
20 clearly apparent that it would be beneficial  
21 towards the bright future ahead for downtown  
22 Brooklyn that these two communities remain under  
23 the same representation in the United States  
24 Congress.



1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 In closing, utilizing politics of any  
3 sort, and I have to repeat that, utilizing  
4 politics of any sort to disenfranchise anyone's  
5 right to vote in fair and Democrat elections are  
6 a direct violation of the Constitution of the  
7 United States and should not, I repeat, should  
8 not at any cost, be allowed to take place. Thank  
9 you.

10 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: Thank you very  
11 much. Reginald Bowman. Reginald Bowman  
12 [phonetic]. Joyce Henry. Joyce Henry.

13 MS. JOYCE HENRY: Good afternoon,  
14 gentlemen, lady. My name is Joyce Henry. To the  
15 members of New York State Legislative Task Force  
16 on Demographic Research and Reapportionment,  
17 LATFOR, good day. Again, my name is Joyce Henry  
18 and I'm a member of Brooklyn. I have lived and  
19 worked in the 11th congressional district for  
20 many years.

21 I thank you for providing me this  
22 opportunity to testify. I support the proposed  
23 map for the 11th congressional district of New  
24 York that was originally submitted to you by

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 Congresswoman Yvette D. Clarke, on August 2nd,  
3 2011. The proposed 11th congressional district  
4 adheres to all the congressional and voting right  
5 acts, redistricting guidelines. I am submitting  
6 a copy of the proposed map in addition to my  
7 testimony.

8 Please give this map your utmost  
9 consideration. The current district includes  
10 many sections of the historic 12th congressional  
11 district which was originally represented by  
12 Honorary Shirley Chisholm, the first African  
13 American female elected congress person. This  
14 district is covered by section 5 of the Voting  
15 Right Act and adheres to the Voting Right Act's  
16 principle for redistricting.

17 The proposed district is defined and by  
18 shared interest such as social, economic,  
19 cultural, linguistic and other factors that  
20 indicate communities of interest. Once again,  
21 thank you for giving me this opportunity.

22 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: Thank you.  
23 Valery Jean. Valery Jean.

24 MS. VALERY JEAN: Good morning. My

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 name is Valery Jean. I'm the Executive Director  
3 of FUREE which stands for Families United for  
4 Racial and Economic Equality. We also sit on  
5 specific engagement work groups have right to the  
6 city to push back network at a New York State  
7 Civic engagement table.

8 We are here in support of redistricting  
9 plan for New York State assembly districts 50 and  
10 57 and we understand the concerns of other  
11 residents that are impacted by the drawing of  
12 these lines but we're hearing concern of uniting  
13 Fort Greene Public Housing residents into Voting  
14 Right Act protected district.

15 Our organization is a non partisan  
16 Brooklyn based multi-racial organization that  
17 mobilizes low income communities to promote  
18 equality, improve economic conditions and  
19 building collective power to win systemic changes  
20 on a local, regional and national level. We are  
21 primarily led by women of color with an emphasis  
22 on community and family and we do that through  
23 direct action, leadership development, community  
24 organizing, civic engagement and political

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 education to help our members reach their vision  
3 and goals.

4 And we also represent a base of more  
5 than 10,000 individuals from our organizing work  
6 in the past ten years and have successfully  
7 turned out thousands of residents who are  
8 unengaged voters to come out and vote and  
9 exercise their political power. And we come here  
10 today in support of redistricting the assembly  
11 districts 57 and 50 to consolidate and restore  
12 houses into the 57th district.

13 Census data from the 2010 Census shows  
14 that Ingersoll and Whitman lie in the second  
15 poorest census tracked in all of New York City  
16 and the poorest census tracked in Brooklyn. And  
17 as a community organization we've seen an influx  
18 of our members losing their jobs or having to  
19 move out of retirement to go into work or have  
20 seen adults having to move in with their parents  
21 because of all of that has been happening from  
22 the economic meltdown.

23 And until quite recently we face a lack  
24 of access to food for over five years and a lack

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 of access to a community center for over eight  
3 years. And while our members in the communities  
4 we served have faced displacement, loss of  
5 housing and jobs, they've also worked hard to  
6 hold decision makers accountable to their needs.

7 And through our efforts and working with  
8 other local stakeholders, we helped to secure a  
9 new affordable supermarket across the street from  
10 public housing that hires locally, which is  
11 really important for our members and our  
12 communities. And so the redrawing of these lines  
13 would consolidate Fort Greene public housing  
14 residents into the one district and will serve  
15 this community interest at a time when it's  
16 critical to build political power for low income  
17 communities in New York State.

18 And our communities and families that  
19 courageously face battles right with developers  
20 who are interested in profit and have very little  
21 interest or zero interest in building sustainable  
22 communities for everyone. And as an organization  
23 that is led by its members, our power is not in  
24 money.

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 Our power is in civic participation from  
3 voting, to accountability forums and meeting with  
4 our representatives to ensure that our voices are  
5 heard and our needs are met. And uniting public  
6 housing developments that are the target of  
7 aggressive development, upcoming federal  
8 regulations that threaten to privatize public  
9 housing and continued personal and community  
10 impacts resulting from the economic crisis seems  
11 to be a natural progression considering the state  
12 of our area. The Fort Greene public housing  
13 residents are increasingly surrounded by high end  
14 luxury housing resulting from the 2004 rezoning  
15 plan of downtown Brooklyn at the edges of Fort  
16 Greene along Flatbush Avenue.

17 And the subsequent population boom of  
18 wealthy residents had led to one of the most  
19 extreme frontiers of inequality in New York City.  
20 The redistricting will help to reverse the voter  
21 dilution of public housing residents and increase  
22 their power in allow them to be more effective in  
23 advocating for their own interest in the face of  
24 these drastic demographic shifts.

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2           And so consolidating the voice and votes  
3 of public housing residents is just one step  
4 further to empower low income people of color in  
5 Fort Greene to better address the issues of  
6 racial, economic inequity, which are all central  
7 to our mission.

8           ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: Thank you.

9 Catherine Smith. Catherine, there we go.

10           MS. CATHERINE SMITH: Good morning. My  
11 name is Catherine Smith. I represent the--I live  
12 in Fort Greene and they need to keep the people  
13 together in Fort Greene that they're trying to  
14 take the apartment from the people and the  
15 schools. We need the schools for the kids. We  
16 need the schools for the kids.

17           They want to change it over to charter  
18 school and they want to put the people out the  
19 projects but we need to stay in there. People  
20 work together and live together, united together.  
21 Since these new coops, they want to change  
22 everything. So I'd like to see a change in Fort  
23 Greene. I would like to see the people stay in  
24 Fort Greene and want the kids, their schools.

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: So you're  
3 agreeing with Ms. Jean--

4 MS. SMITH: Yes.

5 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: On having a  
6 concentration of the public housing?

7 MS. SMITH: Yes, yes.

8 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: Thank you.  
9 Thank you very much. Cory Provost.

10 MR. CORY PROVOST: Good afternoon.  
11 Greetings distinguished members of LATFOR. My  
12 name is Cory Provost and I'm going to really try  
13 and keep my remarks very brief as I just really  
14 wish to echo a few of those that spoke before me.  
15 I'm in complete support of the congressional  
16 district 11 as proposed by Congresswoman, Yvette  
17 Clarke.

18 As a community activist for the past ten  
19 years in my community I believe the most  
20 important thing is to keep us together. I heard  
21 congressional--her draft of the congressional  
22 district does just that. I believe some of the  
23 draft proposals as they were stated are a far cry  
24 from that. Especially as one of the individuals



1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 that spoke before us, when you look at senate  
3 district 20, that is not keeping the community  
4 together.

5 It makes no sense in my own eyes to see  
6 that people that want to represent the  
7 constituents of Brooklyn have to vie from one  
8 side of the borough to the other. That makes no  
9 sense to me at all and I don't know what  
10 mathematics was used to come up with that  
11 equation. But just, real lastly, I think that  
12 the drafts as they were definitely need to be  
13 revisited and

14 I know that's why we're here today but I  
15 did have one question, is there a proposed round  
16 three of public hearings or is this the final  
17 round of hearings?

18 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: This will be  
19 the final round of public hearings and one of the  
20 reasons is we are under the gun the draw the  
21 congressional districts which are not yet drawn  
22 and we have to have this pretty well done by the  
23 end of February because of the federally  
24 established June 26th primary.

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 MR. PROVOST: So there won't be any  
3 public hearings on the congressional lines?

4 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: So far none  
5 have been scheduled and I'm not sure when we  
6 could do them with the amount of time here.  
7 There wasn't the last time either.

8 MR. PROVOST: Okay. Thank you but once  
9 again, I am in complete support of congressional  
10 district 11 as it was proposed by Congresswoman,  
11 Yvette Clarke.

12 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: Thank you.

13 MR. PROVOST: Thank you.

14 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: Evelyn Cruz.  
15 We've received a number of very good suggestions  
16 including specific maps. Congresswoman, Yvette  
17 Clarke's being just one example. There are a  
18 number of ideas that have flown into the Task  
19 force and we do invite, particularly during this  
20 next couple of weeks or so, if you have  
21 additional thoughts, please send them in.

22 MS. EVELYN CRUZ: Good morning or good  
23 afternoon, gentlemen. My name is Evelyn Cruz, I  
24 represent Congresswoman, Nydia Velazquez, of New

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 York's 12th congressional district. Also voting  
3 rights district or a protected district as we  
4 call it.

5 I am here on behalf of the Congresswoman  
6 to extend the support of the recommendation  
7 that's presented here today by our constituents  
8 from Cooper Park houses in Greenpoint Brooklyn.  
9 Those concerns were presented by Ms. Diane  
10 Jackson, Ms. Karen Leader, Ms. Laura Hofmann and  
11 the 200 letters that you received today from our  
12 congressional district members of Cooper Park in  
13 Greenpoint as stated before.

14 We're here to urge the Commission to  
15 reject and revisit the proposed maps for the 50th  
16 and the 53rd assembly district. The community of  
17 Cooper Park in Greenpoint deserve to have a  
18 district that is contiguous not divided. As  
19 public servants, the goal of this Commission  
20 should be to maintain a community compacted and  
21 whole. As presented, the map of the 50th and the  
22 53rd splits a community by a few blocks for  
23 interest unknown.

24 The concerns raised by Ms. Jackson, Ms.

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 Leader and Common Cause regarding the boundaries  
3 of the 53rd and the 50th are valid and should be  
4 considered. The Congresswoman urges this  
5 Commission to revisit it to keep Cooper Park and  
6 the adjacent community again whole and compacted  
7 by extending the assembly district lines to  
8 Metropolitan Avenue and not to Skillman Avenue.  
9 For too long the Cooper Park community, the area  
10 of Greenpoint, particularly that area, which his  
11 underserved, predominantly minority, have been  
12 disenfranchised by government. And it is  
13 critical that we do not, as a Commission,  
14 continue to perpetuate that.

15 So they deserve fair and equal  
16 representation and we're urging the Commission to  
17 revisit, to read cautiously these submissions by  
18 the Cooper Park community and others that you  
19 will be hearing from today. Thank you and have a  
20 good day.

21 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: As you know,  
22 there are mathematical mandates that we have to  
23 live with.

24 MS. CRUZ: Absolutely.

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: If the area in  
3 question which is a development area right now  
4 with great potential is put together, does the  
5 Congresswoman suggest it be put in the 51st  
6 instead of the 53rd or vice versa?

7 MS. CRUZ: We are urging that it remains  
8 in the 50th assembly district.

9 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: We're talking  
10 about the newly drawn ones.

11 MS. CRUZ: Right now it's not in the  
12 50th. The Greenpoint campus is a super block.  
13 It is adjacent to the Cooper Park community.

14 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: So you want it  
15 put together and put entirely in the 50th?

16 MS. CRUZ: Absolutely. It's fair, it's  
17 a fair thing to do.

18 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: Thank you.

19 MS. CRUZ: Thank you.

20 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: I'm going to  
21 go through the list. Is there anyone else before  
22 I do that who would like to get on the list who's  
23 not on here already, hasn't testified? Hearing  
24 none, I'm going to go through the list that we

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 went through this morning and early this  
3 afternoon of the people whose names were here and  
4 were not able to answer the call.

5 That doesn't mean that they haven't sent  
6 something in or they didn't have somebody that  
7 was essentially speaking for them. Jerry  
8 Vatamala, Esmeralda Simmons. Would you like to  
9 speak? Come on up.

10 MS. ESMERALDA SIMMONS: Good afternoon,  
11 members of LATFOR. My name is Esmeralda Simmons  
12 and I serve as the Executive Director of the  
13 Center for Law and Social Justice of Medgar Evars  
14 College of the City University of New York. The  
15 center is a legal advocacy and research  
16 institution that focuses on racial justice  
17 issues, particular those affecting the New York  
18 City resident.

19 The center is also one of the co-authors  
20 of the Unity plan maps submitted to LATFOR as a  
21 model for redistricting of the New York State  
22 Assembly, the New York Senate and New York State  
23 Congressional districts in compliance with the  
24 Voting Rights Act. I testified today on two

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 topics, LATFOR process and its products.

3 LATFOR's actions, and even more, it lack of  
4 action are toying with the precious voting rights  
5 of New Yorkers.

6 There has been nothing commendable about  
7 the bodies official behavior. Rather there has  
8 been gross dereliction of duty and such extreme  
9 official tardiness that the timely success of the  
10 process is at now at severe risk. Even the first  
11 round of hearings across the state were held more  
12 than six months late. At this critical point,  
13 New York State's congressional redistricting is  
14 greatly at risk of not occurring through the  
15 representative process.

16 Although the primary is less than five  
17 months away, LATFOR has not even released its  
18 draft congressional plans, and no explanation.  
19 In addition, because of the political  
20 gerrymandering that is obvious in LATFOR's  
21 assembly and state senate plans, those plans will  
22 probably not be enacted. Further, the process  
23 continues to be a closed process.

24 These public hearings are only a pretext

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 of openness. LATFOR's redistricting criteria has  
3 never been made public. The correct population  
4 data, the basis of redistricting, was only  
5 released in late 2011 when the Census data was  
6 finely adjusted for the prison data.

7 The lateness of releasing the corrected  
8 data, in effect, rendered futile, the public's  
9 attempt to be civically engaged in this process  
10 since many of the suggested plans were drawn on  
11 the earlier release, 2010 Census data, which were  
12 then rendered inaccurate.

13 Unlike other states, New York neither  
14 provided downloadable redistricting software or  
15 online mapping software to be made available to  
16 the public. Although LATFOR's members raised the  
17 issue in August of last year until LATFOR  
18 actually released its plans in late January,  
19 LATFOR never informed the public whether it was  
20 going to draw 62 or 63 senate seats.

21 Thus, thousands of hours were expended  
22 by New Yorkers drawing senate district plans  
23 based upon 62 seats, which were squandered toward  
24 the wrong aim and the resulting product were



1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 rendered less persuasive. There have been no  
3 rationales or explanations given behind the  
4 proposed senate or assembly plans.

5 The plans were released less than two  
6 weeks ago, yet the public is expected to review  
7 these complex facts immediately and rearrange our  
8 lives to testify at these hearings. LATFOR's  
9 flawed draft redistricting plan, I have submitted  
10 this in writing so I'm going to be brief. First,  
11 as I stated before, there is no congressional  
12 plan.

13 The draft senate plan, the Center for  
14 Law and Social Justice remains focused on the  
15 effect that any draft plan would have on the  
16 protected groups, in New York State, under the  
17 Voting Rights Act. There is no clear advantage  
18 to the protected communities in LATFOR 63  
19 district senate plans as configured. In fact,  
20 the Unity Plan, which drew 62 seats did a better  
21 job than LATFOR's 63c Plan. In a Unity Plan, the  
22 shapes of the LATFOR's map invite Shaw versus  
23 Reno based attacks, particularly senate district  
24 20, which many people have spoken about.

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2           In addition, LATFOR continues its mount  
3           apportionment of downstate senate districts by  
4           creating a record standard deviation and a record  
5           average deviation between upstate districts and  
6           downstate districts. This is hardly in the  
7           spirit, a one person, one vote requirement of the  
8           United States Constitution. Though it may meet  
9           the letter of the law. LATFOR's deviation range  
10          is from -5% to +3.8%.

11          The range of the Unity maps was only  
12          from -1.4 to -1.8 for 63 district plan.  
13          According to a recent Nyberg study, the senate  
14          district had no--in 1992, had no districts that  
15          had greater than 3% deviation. In 2002, had 19  
16          districts that have deviations of 3% or greater  
17          but in 2012 has 50 districts that have deviation  
18          that are greater than 3%.

19          Furthermore, the Center for Law and  
20          Social Justice remains unpersuaded that the New  
21          York State Constitution even requires 63 senate  
22          seats. At this point in history, the size of New  
23          York's upper legislative body, which appears to  
24          be merely a political pawn in a highly charged

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 political game.

3 A pawn that can be mutated to further  
4 the political desires of the controlling party.  
5 The Empire State should be above such low  
6 political shenanigans. Such evident disrespect  
7 to the state legislature but its own elected  
8 members engenders broader disrespect to our  
9 legislative bodies by citizens. Isn't the  
10 disrespect already directed toward Albany broad  
11 enough? District 20, we call it the hammer tail  
12 cow.

13 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: Is that the  
14 Asian district?

15 MS. SIMMONS: No.

16 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: I'm sorry.

17 MS. SIMMONS: This is the district in  
18 Brooklyn that has a tail swinging down and goes  
19 across Brooklyn. This district, would be  
20 compact--this district would have been a compact  
21 district of largely black communities of similar  
22 interest but for the fact that it stretches  
23 across Brooklyn via a very narrow tail to link it  
24 with the Borough Park community in the western

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 part of Brooklyn.

3 These geographic areas are remote from  
4 each other. In fact, there is no subway and not  
5 even a direct bus route that links these  
6 communities. This only weakens the black voting  
7 strength of this Crown Heights east New York  
8 Flapper District which currently has a - - voting  
9 age population of 55.5. District 19, why has  
10 Brownsville, a very large community district been  
11 separated from its next door neighborhood,  
12 Canarsie, which has a large and growing black  
13 community.

14 The eastern part of Brooklyn has a  
15 series of dense black communities, east New York,  
16 Brownsville, and its closest southern neighbor,  
17 Canarsie. The latter is a neighborhood with a  
18 burgeoning black population which has elected  
19 several black representatives. In the Unity plan  
20 we continue to tie these neighborhoods together.

21 In the LATFOR plan, however, Canarsie  
22 has been separated from Brownsville and the other  
23 parts of the eastern coast and combined with Mill  
24 Basin, a largely white community. District 31 in

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 Manhattan, why is the farthest northern Manhattan  
3 community of Washington Heights put into a map  
4 that stretches deep down through the western most  
5 area of the upper west side almost to midtown

6 This results in a dilution of the voting  
7 strength of the Latinos and Blacks in Washington  
8 Heights and could impair their ability to elect a  
9 candidate of their choice. This Assembly plan,  
10 in general, the assembly districts are smaller in  
11 New York City and larger upstate but the  
12 variation is not as great as that of the senate  
13 plan.

14 In conclusion, the LATFOR senate plan  
15 appears to violate the Voting Rights Act as it  
16 creates greater electoral opportunities but fails  
17 to provide for greater opportunity for the  
18 protected groups in New York City to elect the  
19 candidates of their choice, even where population  
20 has grown significantly.

21 The LATFOR assembly plan skews towards  
22 smaller districts downstate but does not create  
23 clearly electable districts in all cases.  
24 Clearly at this time, even more time must be

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 spent by LATFOR to create assembly, senate and a  
3 congressional plan that will abide by the spirit  
4 and the letter of the United States Constitution  
5 and the Voting Rights Act. Thank you.

6 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: Thank you.  
7 Councilman David Greenfield. Roslyn--no, she  
8 came. Thelma Moore. Joanne Simon.

9 MS. JOANNE SIMON: Thank you, members of  
10 the Commission. How are you today? My name is  
11 Joanne Simon and I'm the State Committee person  
12 from the 52nd assembly district here in Brooklyn.  
13 My comments will be addressed fairly broadly. I  
14 think that you've heard from many people that the  
15 lines as proposed seem to underscore the  
16 popularity of non partisan redistricting.

17 As presently proposed, and I want to  
18 just say that in terms of the 52nd, I'm not  
19 complaining about the lines in the 52nd but I do  
20 understand that many people have difficulties  
21 with the assembly lines for a variety of reasons  
22 that I think resonate with myself and I believe  
23 should resonate with this Commission.

24 But as presently proposed, the lines

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 really don't reflect the affects of a transparent  
3 process. They don't kept communities together.  
4 They don't reflect well on the legislature's  
5 role, underscoring the public's dissatisfaction  
6 and belief that the people don't matter.

7 And it doesn't advance any public policy  
8 that I can think of, neither transparency, one  
9 person, one vote or the protection of minority  
10 rights. I think obviously a lot of the  
11 discussion has revolved around the senate  
12 districts. I think that the proposed lines do  
13 divide by what looks to be the interest of one  
14 party over another. They divide communities of  
15 interest as well as physical communities.

16 They pit one incumbent against another  
17 for no reason that appears to be consistent with  
18 public policy. I think the 18th and the 20th  
19 have come up as examples of that. I know  
20 certainly my state senator would now be running  
21 against state senator who is also part of the  
22 52nd assembly district. I also want to say that  
23 I think that an answer to one of the questions  
24 that was asked, somebody previously, why it would

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 matter to housing and development.

3 I think it does very much matter that  
4 either the assembly lines or the senate lines are  
5 not pitting people against each other because it  
6 really does come down, in many cases, to state  
7 funding and to state funding programs and that  
8 makes all the difference in the world as to  
9 whether or not we're going to have affordable  
10 housing or not have affordable housing so I think  
11 it does matter that it's important to keep those  
12 communities together.

13 I think that Common Cause has done a  
14 very good job, a very credible job of showing  
15 that you can keep communities together, you can  
16 do it in a transparent way and it can be done  
17 fairly. And so for that reason, I urge the  
18 Governor to veto the present lines and I look  
19 forward to seeing lines that are more consistent  
20 with public policy coming out of the Commission.  
21 Thank you.

22 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: Thank you very  
23 much. David Debose. Dena Reutman. Reginald  
24 Bowman. Daniel Tates [phonetic]. Is there



1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 anyone here who needs to testify now, would like  
3 to testify, yes, come forward. State your name  
4 and if you represent an organization, please say.

5 DR. VONI JOHYN: Good morning. My name  
6 is Dr. Voni Johyn and I am a representative from  
7 the 11th district from the group of Women for  
8 Fairness and Politics and Public Service. I'm  
9 here this morning to basically piggy back on some  
10 of the comments which were made earlier with  
11 regards to Yvette--our Congresswoman, Yvette D.  
12 Clarke. To advocate on behalf of the  
13 Congresswoman, D. Clarke, that represents the  
14 Shirley Chisholm district and for the reenactment  
15 of the voter's right and that it be remembered  
16 that this is the central Brooklyn and that she  
17 represents the largest Caribbean and American  
18 communities and also the newly arriving  
19 immigrants within that district.

20 Congresswoman is being sensitive of the  
21 needs of these immigrants, herself being a child  
22 of immigrants. Therefore, I urge you wonderful  
23 panel, to please adopt the district that is being  
24 presented by Congresswoman and take into

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 consideration her sensitivity of the situations  
3 and the concerns of the Caribbean American  
4 immigrants within these communities. Thank you  
5 for listening.

6 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: Doctor, I  
7 didn't catch your first name, Joan I got. I  
8 messed it up on the last name. What is your  
9 first name?

10 DR. JOHYN: My first name is Voni, V-O-  
11 N-I. And the last name is spelled, J-O-H-Y-N.

12 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: Thank you very  
13 much for your testimony.

14 DR. JOHYN. Thank you. And I can give  
15 you a copy of the voting map.

16 ASSEMBLY MEMBER MCENENY: Is there  
17 anyone else who would like to testify? We Thank  
18 you very much for your participation, we thank  
19 you for your criticism, both positive and  
20 negative and we look forward to seeing some of  
21 you or your representatives throughout this  
22 process. This is our 17th public hearing, the  
23 third with these maps prepared.

24 The schedule, for those who are

1 Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

2 following it, is to have a hearing tomorrow in  
3 Manhattan, one in Queens on Tuesday, one in Long  
4 Island on Thursday and then in the third week,  
5 Syracuse, Rochester and Buffalo, in that order,  
6 on Tuesday, Wednesday, and Thursday.

7 All of the scheduling is on the LATFOR  
8 web site and we continue to welcome input that is  
9 read, taken serious, looked at and considered  
10 very closely, sending it in to LATFOR. You can  
11 send it in electronically or by traditional mail.  
12 We hope to be drawing these districts with  
13 recommended changes in many cases. These maps  
14 are never the last maps.


15 They've always been changed toward the  
16 end and put together legal descriptions during  
17 President's week. That's a break for the State  
18 Legislature, at least for some of us, but not us.  
19 And then when the legislature comes back, if all  
20 goes well, we hope to have legislation to be  
21 voted on. Thank you so much for your input.

22 (The public hearing concluded)

Demographic Research and Reapportionment, 2-1-12

C E R T I F I C A T E

I, April Jones, do hereby certify that the foregoing typewritten transcription, consisting of pages number 1 to XXX, inclusive, is a true record prepared by me and completed from materials provided to me.



Elaine Wylie, Transcriptionist

February 6, 2012